



City of Ukiah, CA Design Review Board

MINUTES

1
2
3 **Regular Meeting**

June 8, 2011

4
5 **Ukiah Civic Center, 300 Seminary Avenue**

6 **1. CALL TO ORDER:** Acting Chair Menton called the Design Review Board called the
7 meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

8
9 **2. ROLL CALL Present:** Tom Liden, Alan Nicholson, Nick Thayer
10 Estok Menton
11 **Absent:** Tom Hise, Richard Moser, Chair
12 **Staff Present:** Kim Jordan, Senior Planner
13 Jennifer Faso, Associate Planner
14 Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary
15 **Others present:** Howie Hawkes
16 Freedom Smith, UVMC
17 Keith Dobbs, UVMC
18 Kate Frey, Kate Frey Landscape Design
19 Mark Schuette, HBE Corporation
20 Mitch Miller, HBE Corporation
21 Tim Rohan, UVMC

22
23 **3. CORRESPONDENCE:** None

24
25 **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** The minutes from the June 1, 2011 meeting will be
26 available for review and approval at the next meeting.

27
28 **5. AUDIENCE COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS:** None

29
30 **6. RIGHT TO APPEAL:** There are no appealable items on this agenda.

31
32 **7. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

33
34 **7A. Ukiah Valley Medical center Preliminary Review: 11-05-PRE-PC.** Conduct a
35 preliminary review for an expansion to the Ukiah Valley Medical Center at 275 Hospital
36 Drive, APN 002-193-23 and 002-160-08.

37
38 **Senior Planner Jordan:**

- 39 • Welcomed UVMC staff, project consultants and architects and thanked the applicant for
40 agreeing the DRB review the project on a preliminary basis in order to receive
41 architectural, site and landscaping feedback on the project.
- 42 • Prior to preparing formal plans and an application, the applicant is specifically requesting
43 direction concerning adequacy of the proposed landscaping due to the constraints of the
44 site and adequacy of the proposed screening for the rooftop units and emergency
45 generator.
- 46 • The proposed project is an addition to an existing building and includes revisions to the
47 ambulance entry and drives aisles, one new emergency generator and transformer east
48 of the new ambulance entry, relocation of the helipad to the roof of the addition,
49 modification of the park and landscaping areas and planting of additional trees.

50
51 **Mark Schuette, HBE Corporation**

- 1 • Explained the project must be approved by the Office of Statewide Health Planning and
2 Development (OSHPD) and this agency reviews all buildings for hospitals, surgery
3 centers and schools that has to do with health licensing requirements.
- 4 • Preliminary plans outlining what the project is about in terms of the shape, size, height,
5 exit/entry locations, paths, color scheme/materials and other series of relevant plan
6 details for the addition were sent to OSHPD for the Ukiah project and the plans are now
7 in the second phase of review with this agency. The process for just approval of the
8 preliminary plans is sensitive. Once approved for construction OSHPD will be making all
9 the inspections to make certain the project complies with state regulations.
- 10 • Emphasized that since OSHPD is the state agency that reviews projects for hospitals,
11 any revisions that require changes to the structural design of the structure will impact the
12 construction schedule of the hospital.
- 13 • Commented on the project with regard to the emergency department improvements,
14 storage of HVAC equipment, new helipad, revisions to the drives and parking, ambulance
15 entry canopy and walk-in entry that will be painted to match the adjacent Outpatient
16 Pavilion, location of emergency generator and transformer location and the plan for
17 screening these facilities from view.
- 18 • Understands the Planning Commission had concerns the buildings on the UVMC campus
19 have a cohesive composition and supports architecturally 'tying-in' the proposed project
20 buildings with that of the UVMC Outpatient Pavilion building and possibly make some
21 architectural modifications to the existing buildings to create that uniformity.
- 22 • The exterior colors are coordinated such that the base and head of the exterior walls and
23 main entrance are conducive with the composition of the existing patient pavilion.
- 24 • Elaborated on the color schemes for the new addition. (Refer to attachment #2 of the
25 staff report).
- 26 • Would like guidance for appropriate landscaping within the available areas.

27
28 **Keith Dobbs, UVMC**

- 29 • UVMC is built when there were three hospitals in town and now it is the only one in town.
- 30 • The goal is to create a design that provides for uniform appearance and the look is that of
31 the Outpatient Pavilion that is currently on the hospital campus.
- 32 • The medical offices across the street having Mediterranean architecture were built by
33 another architectural firm and not with the hospital architecture in mind to provide for that
34 architectural uniformity. The rural medical offices across the street are not owned by
35 UVMC.
- 36 • The plan is to make modifications to the older hospital building so that it too will
37 complement the Outpatient Pavilion to the degree that is economically feasible.
- 38 • The president of UVMC supports having a uniform-looking hospital campus.
- 39 • The proposed expansion is very costly.
- 40 • Provided the Board with photographs of sister hospitals that have or are using HBE
41 Corporation for new construction.

42
43 **DRB:**

- 44 • Looked at overall site plans from HBE Corporation.
- 45 • Likes the exterior and interior design of the Outpatient Pavilion.
- 46 • In addition to the proposed stucco exterior discussed other design themes including
47 signage and building form that would be important to the hospital system.

48
49 **Tim Rohan, UVMC:**

- 50 • The intent is for additions to architecturally complement what is existing whereas
51 historically this was not so much of importance and cited other hospitals in Willits and
52 Lake County that are making improvements to these hospital campuses keeping in mind
53 that uniformity with regard to buildings is important. Understands when the rural medical
54 offices were constructed across the street, the hospital missed out on this opportunity of
55 maintaining uniformity.

- The intent for older designed buildings is to try and incorporate that look with the rest of the campus.
- Addressed the new helipad that will be on the roof of the new building that will replace the existing pad on grade and the associated benefits that will allow for more space on the campus. Also, HBE Corporation has designed a helipad that can accommodate other aircraft that come to the area. For instance, the National Guard can bring in their Blackhawk helicopters and the U S Coast can land their dolphins and other important aircraft/trauma/rescue aircraft that may need to use the facility.

DRB:

- Supports that hospitals are designed with a patient focus wherein the look and feel is not that traditional indifferent/sterile type of building.
- Supports architecture where the rooflines and roofing materials are consistent and complementary with other buildings.
- Emphasized the importance of providing for consistency no matter the design.

Freedom Smith

- There are future plans to make improvements to the obstetric wing to resemble the new addition.

DRB:

- Supports that HVAC equipment and/or other mechanical equipment is well-screened.

There was discussion concerning the 'penthouse' and how the screening for the HVAC equipment and mechanical equipment will be achieved behind stucco finished screening materials on the roof.

DRB:

- Concerned ambulance and walk-in entry to new building are clearly identified.

It was noted signage will be provided to effectively identify departments and accessibility.

Staff:

- In terms of providing landscaping at the front of the hospital on Hospital Drive, normally street trees must be provided one every 30 feet, but with the addition this is not possible. New parking areas would be required to comply with the landscaping requirement unless granted relief by the Planning Commission based upon the size, scale, intensity and location of the development project. The parking requirement is one tree placed between every four parking stalls within a continuous linear planting strip. The applicant is requesting relief from the landscaping requirements and would like suggestions regarding creative ways to address landscaping.
- Asked the Board to make suggestions about the proposed building and landscaping.
- In terms of landscaping, it makes sense that trees may not be appropriate in certain areas.

DRB:

- Understands the hospital campus is constrained for space in order to provide for extensive landscaping, but would like to look at options.
- Supports if OSHPD regulations allow, providing for landscaping to soften the western fascia and screen from the hot sun where feasible.
- Understands with regard to tree species there are height restrictions since the hospital is located in the B-2 Infill Zone that allows the expansion of existing hospital facilities provided the buildings are single story and the use does not exceed an intensity of 60 persons per acre.

- 1 • Because the project is subject to state regulations, these regulations will 'trump' City
2 regulations.
3

4 **Staff:** While the State has that option, there is flexibility and the Planning Commission can make
5 certain modifications during the discretionary review process. Of importance is to make a
6 recommendation regarding landscaping that is subject to possible modification. Encouraged the
7 DRB to do what they always do and that is to make design recommendations even though the
8 design recommendations may not work with OSHPD.
9

10 **DRB building design and landscaping comments/questions:**

- 11 • Would not be able to provide a lot of shade trees along the western front because of
12 possible interference with the flight path. Energy conservation is important and there may
13 be possible ways to address this element on the building itself such as with build-in
14 overhangs that do not interfere with flight path of helicopters.
15 • There could be vegetative screening in the front planter bed of the addition in terms of
16 addressing energy conservation and shading the western front from the hot summer sun.
17 • While the color scheme will effectively break up the 'boxy-feel' of the building, vegetation
18 will help.
19 • Another way to mitigate the western sun would be to install recessed windows or provide
20 for some type of projection and architectural element to tie these features into the overall
21 design concept. This should not alter the function and/or layout of the building.
22

23 **Mitchell L. Miller, HBE Corporation**

- 24 • Architectural changes could conflict with OSHPD regulations, particularly on the north
25 end of the building because there are minimum requirements for ICU rooms.
26 • Concerned about possible reduction of square footage with changing the design of
27 windows for the offices located on the southwest elevation.
28

29 **DRB building design and landscaping comments/questions:**

- 30 • Change in design of the windows and/or other changes to the exterior of the building for
31 screening purposes would not change the square footage of the building or function if the
32 concern is to conserve as much office space as possible.
33 • The intent is to articulate the building in such a manner to limit the amount of light coming
34 in, particularly during the summer months and this can be accomplished by possibly
35 constructing a trellis having deciduous vines that can provide shade and this should not
36 affect the function of the building.
37 • Understands that changing any portion of the design could possibly jeopardize the
38 funding for the project and/or cause the process to have to start over. Likes the design
39 concept of the covered entryway to the walk-in emergency and possibly extending this
40 feature, which would likely affect the parking availability in this area. This would allow for
41 pedestrian access from the street.
42 • It is important every effort is made to make the entrance architecturally presentable such
43 that there is that connection from the street to the hospital waiting room. Depending on
44 the reason for going to the hospital a person could walk from the street through the
45 entrance if it were extended or drive to the entrance. Noted, the emergency room has a
46 separate entry for ambulance.
47

48 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 49 • A trellis would impact the structure even if it is not attached to the building because there
50 are safety issues associated with the chance vegetation could combust during certain
51 times of the year. Trellises also block fight fighting ability. Trellises may be acceptable
52 provided that are constructed at least 10 feet away from the building.
53

54 **DRB building design and landscaping comments/questions:**

- 55 • Does OSHPD also review the landscaping and parking for the project?

1
2 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 3 • OSHPD does review landscaping and parking for the project from the perspective of
4 ensuring compliance with requirements.
5

6 **DRB building design and landscaping comments/questions:**

- 7 • Would the installation of skylights be a consideration in the waiting area for the new
8 building similar to the skylights in the Outpatient pavilion? The skylights are what 'really
9 make' the waiting area aesthetically pleasing for the Pavilion.
10 • Natural light from skylights can be soothing and comforting.

11
12 It was noted the waiting area may be too close to the helipad to have skylights.
13

14 **DRB building design and landscaping comments/questions:**

- 15 • Asked about the paving that would be done on the south side of the addition and whether
16 some of this paving is existing?
17

18 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 19 • There is currently parking at the edge where the helicopter pad is located and in front of
20 the Pavilion and demonstrated on the site plans the location of existing parking
21 accommodations and where new parking is proposed.
22 • The intent is to compensate for the addition of more trees.
23 • Noted the walk-in area shown on the site plans is not the main entrance to the hospital
24 and this is the entrance that would be used for patient admission purposes.
25

26 **DRB building design and landscaping comments:**

- 27 • Does support extending the entrance for the addition.
28 • Access to the building appears to be confusing. As designed, no one would be walking to
29 the building from the street. If there is a pedestrian entrance, people would have to walk
30 north or south to the entrance from the street or parking area.
31 • Important to utilize space for entrances efficiently, noting there is a philosophy/connection
32 as to how entrances are identified.
33

34 **Freedom Smith:**

- 35 • The entrance as shown on the site plan is the main entrance to the emergency room so
36 anyone coming to the hospital aside from a patient would enter at this point.
37

38 **Staff:** There may be a way to make the entrance 'more pronounced' without affecting the building
39 by somehow highlighting it for use by pedestrians.
40

41 **Mitchell L. Miller:** OSHPD requires a covered drive-up area for drop-off of patients that has
42 specific limitations for size and slope and no pedestrian access is allowed through this required
43 drop-off zone.
44

45 **Keith Dobbs:** It may be pedestrian access will be improved on Hospital Drive as City Council
46 approved the construction of a new and major crosswalk that does change the structure of the
47 street.
48

49 **DRB building design and landscaping comments:**

- 50 • Recommends application of permeable paving where feasible for new parking.
51 • Add more trees where feasible in the landscape areas and parking lot such that there is
52 no interference with the helipad and in compliance with the C-2 zoning district for parking
53 and landscaping as to landscaping coverage, application of planter strips, pedestrian
54 sidewalks/marked pedestrian facilities separate from parking areas, and for parking lots,

1 one tree placed between every four parking stalls where possible since the site is
2 constrained in terms of space.

- 3 • Be selective in the landscaping species for trees and vegetation that would complement
4 the building and provide for some screening.
- 5 • The site plans indicate a large grassy area on the south side of the addition and is this
6 area intended for landscaping.
7

8 **Staff:** It may be the applicant will seek relief from parking and landscaping requirements relative
9 to compliance with FAA regulations for the operation of a helipad on the rooftop of the building.
10

11 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 12 • This area contains the underground fuel tank whereby trees cannot be planted. This area
13 can accommodate some landscaping.
14

15 **Staff:** A lawn area is shown on the site plans and inquired if this is the intent or is this area a
16 place holder for something else?
17

18 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 19 • Is likely a placeholder at this point.
20

21 **Member Nicholson:**

- 22 • Is of the opinion, much of the addition looks that a service/factory facility that contain
23 bays/roll-up doors for service trucks/vehicles. Making the building appear clean and flat
24 presents a very pedestrian unfriendly environment.
- 25 • Is not the type of building that makes for good neighbors.
- 26 • Supports softening of the building design to make it more neighborhood friendly and
27 healing to the community.
- 28 • Hospitals are symbolically a place of healing, health, nurturing and well-being. The
29 addition, as presented, does not present a friendly appearance or environment.
- 30 • Without trellises, 'sun-shading' techniques could be used, such as horizontal or vertical
31 laticing to break up the building mass.
- 32 • The design is likely a 'programmed' plan.
33

34 **Mitchell L. Miller:** The client has a programmed concept of what fits the needs for the hospital
35 and community whereby the job of HBE Corporation, as a design consultant, is to listen to the
36 hospital needs before designing a project and formulating a floor plan in order for the project to
37 work and meet code requirements. UVMC has a budget to work with and it is HBE's job to work
38 within those parameters.
39

40 The intent of HBE Corporation is to design a floor plan that works within the budget of UVMC,
41 meets the hospital objective in terms of function, complements the existing buildings and is
42 aesthetically pleasing to the neighborhood.
43

44 **Member Nicholson:**

- 45 • Not his place to design the building.
- 46 • Would be nice to add some features to soften the building's appearance, in which
47 planting landscaping may be of assistance in this regard.
48

49 There was discussion concerning landscaping and providing for a courtyard that has benches
50 and landscaping for people visiting to meet in a calming/stress-free atmosphere as a way to
51 soften the building.
52

53 **Kate Frey, Kate Frey Landscaping Design:**

- 54 • Has designed a healing garden on the north end of the building next to the 'OB' wing that
55 will have benches and landscaping features.

- 1 • This is just the beginning of other similar projects to soften buildings of the UVMC.
2

3 **Mitchell L. Miller:**

- 4 • HBE Corporation would be amenable to landscaping and providing other amenities in the
5 area where the underground tanks are located.
6 • An enclosed courtyard and/or landscaped visual area is planned for the new addition.
7

8 **DRB building design and landscaping comments:**

- 9 • When considering buildings for hospitals, OSHPD should think about not only what they
10 need to accomplish in the way of function, but rather how the building looks and feels to
11 the community keeping in mind the application of landscaping, methods to conserve
12 energy, and how to soften the appearance in order to become a welcoming environment
13 for the good of patients, families and visitors.
14 • There is really no excuse, but to design a building that has a positive effect on people
15 and the environment.
16 • Hospitals are supposed to be a place where people heal and get better whereby the
17 design help shapes the attitude and this can be done in very subtle ways without change
18 to the overall structure of the building.
19

20 **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

- 21 **8A.** Continue working on development of Downtown Zoning Code Design District Guidelines.
22

23 Discussion of this matter was deferred to next meeting.
24

- 25 **9. MATTERS FROM THE BOARD:** None
26

27 **10. MATTERS FROM STAFF:**

28 The City Council on June 15, 2011 will consider DRB Howie Hawkes' application to serve on the
29 DRB.
30

31 Staff asked the Board to think about a date and time once a month when the Board can meet
32 such that a quorum is guaranteed and added there will be times when the Board may need to
33 meet more than once a month to discuss matters of urgency.
34

- 35 **11. SET NEXT MEETING/ADJOURNMENT:** The next meeting will be June 15, 2011 at 2:30
36 p.m. The meeting adjourned at 5:06 p.m.
37

38 _____
39 Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary