1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chair Hise called the Design Review Board meeting to order at 3:04 p.m.

2. **ROLL CALL:**
   - **Present:** Tom Liden, Alan Nicholson, Nick Thayer, Howie Hawkes, Estok Menton, Chair Tom Hise
   - **Absent:** None
   - **Staff Present:** Kim Jordan, Senior Planner
     Jennifer Faso, Associate Planner
     Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary
   - **Others present:** Steve Calcagno
     Joseph Welch
     Peter Kahn
     David Babcock
     Gary Akerstrom
     Jeff Fowler
     Guy Mills

3. **CORRESPONDENCE:** None

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** - The minutes from the September 1, 2011 and October 13, 2011 meetings are included for review.
   
   **M/S Liden/Hawkes** to approve the September 1, 2011 and October 13, 2011 minutes, as submitted with Member Menton abstaining.

5. **AUDIENCE COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS:** None.

6. **RIGHT TO APPEAL:** There are no appealable items.

7. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS:**

   7A. **Costco Warehouse and Fuel Station File No. 11-01.** Conduct a public hearing and make recommendations to the Planning Commission on design and landscaping for the proposed Costco Warehouse and Fuel Station to be located within the Airport Industrial Park.

   **Staff:**
   - The project consists of the following components:
     - Construction of a new 137,620 square foot wholesale warehouse.
     - Construction of a new 16-pump gas facility with the approval for expansion to 20-pumps.
     - A Boundary Line Adjustment (BLA) to consolidate the several existing parcels into two.
     - A Site Development Permit (SDP) for the proposed building and site layout.
     - A general rezone of the project site to retail commercial.
The project is located outside of the Downtown Design District so the project is not required to go through the DRB process. Costco has voluntarily offered to come to the DRB to receive comments on their project specific to site design and architecture.

Staff has provided the Board with Airport Industrial Park Ordinance 1098 that governs land/land uses in the Airport Industrial Park. The project is zoned AIP PD and subject specifically to the ‘retail commercial’ land use designation.

Staff also provided the Board with the design guidelines for properties ‘outside of the Downtown Design District.’

Staff will prepare an analysis of the project when it goes to the Planning Commission and also as part of the EIR that will include an analysis of the project for consistency with the Ukiah General Plan and zoning designation.

As shown on ‘Exhibit B’ of the AIP Circulation Plan, the light manufacturing/mixed use land use designation portion of the property will have to be rezoned to retail commercial as part of the project application and City Council will determine whether or not the rezone is appropriate for the site.

David Babcock of David Babcock & Associates, Landscape Architect for the Project:

- Introduced Steve Calcagno, Civil Engineer for Kier & Wright Civil Engineers & Surveyors, Inc., Peter Kahn, Project Manager for Costco and Joseph Welch of Mulvanny G2 Architects
- Will answer questions from the Board concerning the design aspects of the project.

David Babcock/Steve Calcagno gave a PowerPoint presentation concerning the project as described in Attachment 1 with comments about:

- The location of the project and site description and referred to the concept site plan, sheet 3.
- It is important the building is nicely designed from all elevations and view points, functions well and that the site provides for good circulation and referred to site lines and sections, sheet 7 in relation to the neighboring infrastructure and other buildings in the area.
- Commented on the proposed building orientation and the reason why the particular design works well for the layout of the site, particularly with the site being looked upon as a gateway to the City.
- The design allows for parking to be on two sides of the buildings so that parking is spread around and not all concentrated right in front.
- The site plan objective is to provide for a nice pedestrian orientation/interaction by designing the driveways to be as far away from the entrance as possible such that people cannot drive right up to the store.
- Costco parking stalls are typically wider than other retail establishments to accommodate larger trucks and/or vehicles.
- Referred to the floor plan and noted the Ukiah Costco will feature a bakery, pharmacy, optical center, hearing aid testing center, food court, a photocenter, a tire center, and other features that may be ‘typical’ of Costco. Other site amenities include landscaping, a parking lot, and a gas station.
- The tire center will include retail tire sales and a tire installation facility and explained how this project component will function.
- Addressed the layout for the proposed gas station facility and how it would function without tying up the traffic inside the queuing of the gas station. In order to open and operate the gas facility, local, state and federal environmental requirements must be met related to disposal of hazardous materials, underground fuel tanks, and implementation of spill prevention countermeasures to prevent petroleum product spills into nearby water ways and/or water detention facilities.
- Explained how truck deliveries will occur where the intent is to create a design that would not disrupt the drive isles and/or traffic on the site.
More specifically described how the building orientation and on-site circulation addresses the element of ‘connectivity’ with regard to curbs, gutter and sidewalks and sidewalks that meander. Costco’s objective is to create a ‘sensitivity’ towards the pedestrian and this can be accomplished by providing a pedestrian connection throughout the project.

Generally explained the unique floor plan for the Ukiah Costco that will assist with effective customer flow/circulation so members can enjoy their shopping experience.

Space has been provided for new freezers and coolers and demonstrated the location.

Costco will sell a variety of products in a large number of product categories and demonstrated how products will be organized and shelved for customer convenience.

Emphasized that the entrance to the establishment is very important and describe how this will be articulated.

The design/materials/color scheme concepts selected for the building provide for an architecturally pleasing project that is energy efficient/sustainable, architecturally welcoming/good fit for Ukiah, environmentally conscious, has an nice contemporary style, effectively provide for proper massing because the building is essentially big-box, is harmonious/complements other buildings in the neighborhood in order to best minimize the visual impact of a large retail warehouse. The objective is ‘simplicity’ that creates architecture true to Costco’s business plan, which lends itself to a project that is high quality, durability, and has value.

Specifically discussed the building elevations as shown on the site plans by demonstrating how the design features/techniques, color schemes, and materials, texture of material and placement work congruently to provide for a nice blend and an aesthetically pleasing appearance.

The combining of concrete and architectural metal panels will help reduce the visual impact.

Through the use of design techniques such as the orientation of the metal panel, landscaping, the incorporation of varying parapet cap depths and heights will successfully break the long elevations both horizontally and vertically on the building.

The building design includes signage that is scaled appropriately to the mass of the building elevations so as to not to be overwhelming. The warehouse signage will consist of externally illuminated reverse pan channel letters and the gas station signage will also be externally illuminated that is consistent with the International Dark Sky Association policies/recommendations. Building signage will be the Costco red and blue corporate colors. Costco does not utilize monument or pylon signs.

There is also signage for the gas station that will also be internally lit and in accordance with the International Dark Sky Association requirements.

The project will feature all the brand new thinking of today’s Costco projects. As such, skylights are part of the design features to take advantage of natural sunlight were feasible and appropriate. Accordingly, lighting systems and placement of lighting fixtures also designed to properly fit the design, size/scale of the building. The lighting systems represent the latest technology in that they are computerized to light up or dim as necessary. Indoor lighting will adjust to the lighting conditions for the building, which is a huge energy savings.

The type of equipment that will be used in the building to heat and cool, refrigeration equipment, etc., are of high energy efficiency.

Referred to the concept landscape plan that features a variety of trees and vegetative shrubs, perennials and grasses and discussed the proposed landscape area plan objectives. Tree plantings will provide a substantial level of parking lot shading and will serve to reduce summer heat gain with the parking
field. A substantial amount of the proposed plants will be drought tolerant that will use less water compared to other types of species. The water/irrigation system proposed will reduce water consumption.

- There are ‘generous bio-swales’ on the site and demonstrated their location on the site plans. The project will use bio-swales in planters.
- The project includes a small water retention basin at the lower end of the site. The majority of the parking lot runoff will drain into this basin. In this way, the project complies with the EPA requirements and the State Water Resources Control Board relative to water treatment and water quality standards. Many of the storm water regulations are over and beyond what you would see, but Costco takes measures to ensure this.
- Addressed the shade plan objective for compliance with the City’s 50% shade canopy requirement for parking lots and the project’s intent in this regard, noting compliance with this requirement is difficult.
- There was discussion about the truck loading dock located at the north edge of the building and how this facility will function. A transformer and two trash compactors would also be located along the north edge of the building and sufficiently screened.
- The HVAC units and other systems will be sufficiently screened.
- The proposed color scheme chosen are warm natural earth tones which relate to the neighborhood and some of the more recent buildings developed in the area.
- Again, of priority is to design a project that specifically addresses energy conservation through the use of energy efficient lighting systems, reflective roof material to produce lower heat absorption and thereby lowering energy consumption during the hot summer months. Costco uses a management system called daylight harvesting’ to monitor and adjust mechanical and lighting systems to conserve energy. With the new building, it is possible to maximize the amount of daylight allowed into the building and take advantage of the free energy the sun can provide. The skylights, light sensors, associated control systems, energy-efficient HVAC units, building orientation and associated design feature will result in energy savings and efficiency.
- The project plans also include a preliminary grading and drainage plan and a preliminary utility plan.

There was discussion about:

- The potential use of a portico at the entrance like Home Depot has so that members can take advantage of loading merchandise, particularly during rainy conditions. It was noted waiting for a vehicle to come, a customer cannot stop and load merchandise for safety reasons. The area in front of the building is designated as a fire lane. A portico would be problematic if store only has one entrance. The applicant will work with staff on the issue of having an area where people can have a loading zone because this is usually a concern for projects. A customer can always ask Costco staff to help with loading of merchandise or unloading of merchandise if there is a return.
- Parking, layout of the parking lot and the number of parking spaces required and proposed, noting parking for the project should be sufficient. It was further noted the majority of the parking stalls will be 10 feet wide and 18½ feet long and will take up considerable space. In other words, stalls are deeper and wider than what is standard. Nine feet wide parking spaces may be installed at the far end of the parking lot should there be a ‘pinch for space.’ Typically, Costco provides for plenty of parking accommodations for their projects. The total number of parking spaces proposed for the Ukiah Costco is 643 that include 14 accessible stalls.

Board questions:

Q1: What is the highest point of the building? What is the plan for shade trees?
Q2: Will permeable paving be a part of the project?
Q3: Do all the roof collection, gutters and downspouts utilize the same drainage flows as the parking lot?

Q4: Is traffic mitigation a topic for discussion?

Q5: With regard to water systems, if sustainability is a project goal, why is there no water attachment and/or drain water recycling system on the site to be used for landscape use.

Q6: Are the trees going to be irrigated?

Q7: Will the project meet the City’s 50% shade requirement for parking lot trees?

Q8: Asked for clarification regarding the ‘champagne façade’ relative to the metallic treatment on the building.

Q9: Asked for clarification about building treatments and effects thereof.

Costco Representatives:
A1: The highest parapet is 34 feet and the lowest is 31 feet. To appropriately comply with the City’s 20% landscaping standards and shade preference, Elms are proposed to shade the building that will reach 25 to 30 feet at maturity.

A2: The paving materials are traditional asphalt.

- While the technology for the application of permeable paving is coming, Costco builds projects to last a long time. For instance, there is a 25-year warranty on the paint and metal on the building, as well as a 20-year warranty for the parking lot material.
- The intent is to build once and provide for low maintenance.
- In terms of maintenance, the parking lot will be swept every evening.
- The intent is to maintain a clean parking lot such that the excess water runoff from the parking lot is also clean.
- Is not satisfied that permeable paving is durable enough to get the kind of warranty that traditional asphalt gives, particularly with the amount of traffic that a Costco store generates.
- Is of the opinion permeable paving has not been around long enough and the studies are not available.
- There may be opportunities for permeable paving in the future.

A3: The runoff water in this regard is channeled into the storm water drainage system and is a standard procedure for all Costco stores.

Gary Akerstrom:
- Is the developer of Redwood Business Park.
- In terms of permeable pavement in the Ukiah area, the normal ground soil Ukiah has is a lot of sand and clay composition so as a result permeable pavement does not work here.
- Briefly commented on the issue of runoff, drainage and streets and the condition of streets in Ukiah.

Costco representative:
- Costco has recently been incorporating underdrains in their project parking lots similar to french or burrito drains underneath areas such as landscape isles to capture water from surface areas or other. As a result of the underdrains the life span of surfaces has increased.

Gary Akerstrom:
- Commented the detention basin for the site during storm conditions will fill up in approximately two hours and noted the existing pond in the area is very helpful with water
detention before discharge into the Russian River. The pond does capture water runoff from the Airport and Redwood Business Park.

**Costco representative:**
- In addition to the pond, much of the water drains into the Caltrans ditch along Highway 101 that goes unmetered to the low lying down stream area.

**Gary Akerstrom:**
- Is familiar with drainage issues in the area, has performed some calculations in this regard and advised water goes through a culvert under the freeway, which is actually a very short distance to the Russian River. Anything more than a two-year storm condition, everything on the east side of freeway is under water and this is something to consider. It does not pay to do a detailed analysis of a ditch that goes down stream on the east side of the freeway. Again, recommends taking advantage of the pond for drainage purposes, as well as utilize it as a landscape feature in combination thereof.

**Jeff Fowler, Ken Fowler Auto**
- Has a car dealership to the north of the proposed project.
- Discussed how access will occur for large trucks making deliveries at the northern portion of the parcel adjacent to his dealership and is of the opinion there should be no problems with this approach.
- Addressed the proposed landscaping for the site and is concerned with pollen and/or other types of debris from trees will blow on his cars displayed for sale.

**Costco representative:**
- In terms of access, certain sections of the cul-de-sac on Airport Park Boulevard will be redone having a different curb line/cut for access to the site, particularly for the benefit of large trucks.
- One of the most important functions of a Costco is truck deliveries and explained what will occur for truck deliveries with the unloading of palates and added the truck loading dock would be located at the north edge of the building within the building area. The facility would face east and include three individual side-by-side loading bays. A low screen wall would be constructed along the edge of the dock, facing north to help mitigate visual impacts. All docks will face in one direction so that any noise potential would be channeled to the east toward the highway.
- Will consider the tree species so the trees will not impact neighbors. Referred to conceptual landscape plan, sheet 9.

**Costco representative:**
- City Planning staff has indicated the topic of potential traffic impacts and mitigation measures was not part of today’s design review discussion of the project.
- Costco wants the traffic matter to work and would not pursue the project knowing there is a traffic problem. Traffic studies will provide the necessary information about potential impacts and mitigations measures.
- On-site drainage and corresponding water collecting/storage systems has been a consideration. Will look into water conservation options.
- Has a sophisticated watering system for the trees that includes bio-swales. Depending upon the nature of the soil, appropriate drainage systems will be provided. Costco works with a soil scientist to assist with determining the appropriate irrigation system for trees and vegetation. Costco provides for a unique program for irrigation and maintenance of vegetation and trees. In terms of sustainability and water conservation, lawns are no longer part of the landscaping program. Landscaping species are selected based on durability and ability to adapt in a retail environment in addition to selecting plants that are drought tolerate and native to the area. Elaborate landscaping techniques/systems are
applied so that vegetation can survive, thrive and grow to maturity. Costco wants their landscaping to grow and look good. Talked about Costco’s sustainability practices.

A7: Will comply with the City’s 50% shade requirement and referred to sheet 10, shade plan and sheet 10.1, comparative shade plan.

A8: The application results in a ‘shadow relief’ effect relative to the metallic sheen material instrumental in reducing heat gain for the building to conserve energy. From an aesthetic standpoint, the color of metallic sheen will change color throughout the day from an earth tone color i.e., from a brown to a light brown to a silver color. This material treatment provides a nice contrast with the light colors being applied.

A9: Commented on the ‘metal profile’ application treatment and noted one will be oriented horizontally for the box rib. The ‘less aggressive rib metal panel’ provides for a bat and board appearance and will be oriented vertically. Demonstrated why and how the materials can be applied vertically and horizontally to provide for an architecturally pleasing effect.

Board comments:

- Project needs more than one point of egress for trucks, etc.
- The project objective says the building shall be shaped and oriented to take advantage of passive solar energy and solar collection in the winter, as well as energy efficient measures for keeping the building cool in the summer. Encourages taking advantage of photovoltaic opportunities as much as possible.
- It appears that most of ‘loads’ will be electrical for the cooling, refrigeration and lighting and applauds that Costco uses an energy management system (daylight harvesting) and integrated energy management systems that offer centralized controls and monitoring for lights, HVAC and refrigeration.
- Understands applicant is working on keeping down maintenance/sustainability costs and further encourages the use of photovoltaic opportunities.
- Likes that LED lighting is utilized in display cases and in freezer/cooler doors; that interior and exterior HID lighting systems continually increase efficiency; photo sensors will be installed in the skylights throughout the warehouse that automate the control of HID lighting, minimizing use of artificial lighting; Refrigeration systems will convert waste heat to reheat hot water tanks, night screens are installed on all open refrigeration cases reducing cooling loss and energy on refrigeration compressors, localized energy controls to be install in all refrigeration units, air doors to be installed in produce coolers, using air flow to contain cool air in the interior.
- Likes the building orientation and presentation.
- Some members and employees may want to bicycle to Costco.
- Consider parking area vehicles that are battery/solar operated with recharging facilities.
- Design the entryway so that people have a covered/protected area where they can wait for or meet other people.
- Likes that lighting fixtures are consistent with the International Dark Sky Association standards.
- Likes the color palate selected for the building.
- Related to the building articulation and massing would like to see some architectural features from the Ukiah Brewery somehow incorporated into the design aspect for the Project.
- Supports plant species that are perennial.
- Likes the selection of trees for the parking lot.
- Replace Crape Myrtle with California Redbud.
- Provide for shading on the east side of the building to keep the signage accessible in that narrow space in order to provide some morning shade.
- Reorient vegetation to provide for improved visual access into the site with regard to signage and provide for better anchored/defined/accented corners. This would allow for ‘cleaner site lines.’
- Provide for more native plants.
- Better integration of the ‘understored planting.’
- Would like to see the plant species for the bio-swale to better understand how the bio-swale will be implemented.
- The revised City Master Tree List that has not yet been approved by and/or adopted Council would be helpful with the selection of appropriate trees for the project.
- Concern was expressed about the ‘box appearance’ and massing of the building.
- An entry canopy is a nice feature.
- Understands the building is a ‘box’ and recommends adding a few other roof overhangs to soften the appearance of the building by helping to break up the horizontal mass.
- Asked about the north side of the building and what is supposed to occur on the east elevation.
- It appears the south elevation is ‘busier’ than the others.
- Consider deep roof overhangs that create shadows off of the building that add variety aesthetically.
- Make certain the site interior is pedestrian and bicycle friendly that provides for a nice connection to different areas on the site. Supports having a pedestrian pathway on the south side of the building that would provide for accessibility and a nice connection between the building and parking lot.
- Pathways/sidewalks should be wide enough that two or three persons could comfortably walk side-by-side or even a baby carriage; possibly having a 6-8 foot width.
- Shade/protection measures from weather conditions would be helpful on the south side of the building.
- Likes the proposed project overall, noting consideration is given to including as much sustainable practices as possible, that attention has been paid to building orientation, landscaping, drainage, water and energy conservation and aesthetics.
- Not include arches in the design.
- Likes the building orientation and sight lines people will be looking at when driving to the site, color scheme, building treatments and materials that aesthetically provide for an appealing building even though the building is a big box structure.
- The building and site design will not be too overwhelming.
- The proposed design is similar to that of the Rohnert Park Costco.
- Likes the presentation of the entry.
- Questions the location of the tire bay. Moving the bay farther east would interfere with an already nice view of the project from the freeway. It may be tire bay should be developed to the north side of the building if this is workable.
- Develop a pedestrian way for buses and bicycles coming in. A person could park further away and take the pathway. Otherwise, there is no place for people to walk with the current layout in the area where the bay exists now. There is also no overhang for protection purposes and as currently designed presents a safety hazard because there is no place for people to walk. Someone would have to direct traffic as it is now just to get traffic in and out of the bay. There is also the matter of where people are going to park for those persons waiting to get tire service. Recommends rethinking the south exposure in terms of safety, accessibility and allowing for an adequate pedestrian connection with overhangs where feasible as long as they do not hang over the curb to shield people from the rain. Other than this issue, the project is nicely designed.

David Babcock comments:
- The building is designed to receive solar at some future date if appropriate so the engineering for solar panels is already set in place. The roof will be metal. The number of skylights in the food service area has been reduced to conserve energy because they are not necessary in this location. Skylights are essentially important to light the isles for the members. On a day like today in December, it is possible to operate the warehouse on basically 25% of its lighting because of ‘daylight harvesting.’ The building is designed to take advantage of sunlight where feasible/sustainable. Providing for sufficient shade from
vegetation and building materials/treatments as well as the orientation of the building will help to keep energy costs down.

- There was discussion about the addition of a Class III bicycle lane in the area that was addressed in the EIR for the Walmart Expansion Project.
- The food service area/food court area will have tables and chairs for people to meet and this area is immediately accessible when one walks in the entrance. If it is cold and windy, people can go inside the building. Accordingly, the building will have a 26½-foot overhang that will serve as a cover.
- The light fixture for the parking lot will be consistent with the International Dark Sky Association standards.
- Is open to looking at the City’s Master Tree List.
- There will be a flat canopy over the doors that will wrap around over what is called the ‘bread door,’ which functions as a service truck and receiving door. The intent of this feature is to help break up the horizontal appearance. Referred to the site plans and commented on the different elevations to explain the location of the canopies, how shadowing will occur and how water would be shed. The canopy will extend outward from the edge of the building and will cast some shadowing below it.
- Referred to sheets 5 and 5.1 that show the different elevations for the building and the plans for varying treatments i.e., parapets that will break up the mass of the building.
- Further discussed the concept of ‘shadow casting’ with regard to canopies and use of materials/treatments to assist with the element of massing and enhance aesthetics.

8. MATTERS FROM THE BOARD

There was some discussion about the issue of traffic impacts and whether there are mechanisms in place requiring Costco to pay for improvements.

10. MATTERS FROM STAFF

There was discussion about the future of the DRB since it is a function of the RDA that may or may not be allowed to exist under California State Law. A decision will be made by the State in January about whether or not city redevelopment agencies in California will be dissolved.

11. SET NEXT MEETING/ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary