Regular Meeting
March 26, 2015

Ukiah Civic Center, 300 Seminary Avenue

1. CALL TO ORDER: Vice Chair Liden called the Design Review Board meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. in Conference Room #3.

2. ROLL CALL
   Present: Vice Chair Tom Liden, Alan Nicholson, Howie Hawkes, Colin Morrow, Nick Thayer
   Absent:
   Staff Present: Charley Stump, Planning Director
   Michelle Johnson, Assistant Planner
   Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary
   Others present: Dan Thomas
   Reed Finlay

3. CORRESPONDENCE:

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: The minutes from the March 3, 2015 and March 12, 2015 meeting are available for review and approval.

M/S Nicholson/Morrow to approve March 3, 2015 and March 12, 2015 minutes, as submitted.
Motion carried by all AYE voice vote. (5-0)

5. AUDIENCE COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

The DRB is required by the City Code to review and make a recommendation on all Site Development Permit applications.

6. NEW BUSINESS:
6A. Chipotle’s Mexican Grill Restaurant 596 East Perkins Street, (File No.: 842) Review and recommendation to Planning Commission on a Site Development Permit for construction of a 2,000 square foot Chipotle Mexican Grill restaurant on the vacant parcel located in the Downtown Zoning District at the northwest corner of East Perkins Street and Orchard Avenue. On-site parking and landscaping are also proposed, as is outdoor dining along both street frontages at 596 East Perkins Street, APN 002-200-38.

Planning Director Stump introduced the proposed Project:
- Today’s DRB meeting is a request for preliminary review for a Chipotle’s Mexican Grill Restaurant.
- The proposed Project is located in the DZC UC (Urban Center) zoning district. As such, the Project does not comply with certain corresponding zoning standards where the applicant is likely to seek exceptions related to 1) the two-story building requirement; 2) project is over-parked; and 3) 70% street frontage is necessary for buildings located on primary streets.
Reed Finlay, Project Architect referred to the conceptual site plans and commented on the proposed Project:

- Explained Chipotle Mexican Grill restaurants have high standards and guiding principles when it comes to quality of food and restaurant design. The company’s motto is to provide ‘food with integrity’ by helping people rethink the way they eat and goes to great lengths to make certain their food is sourced, healthy and without out toxins.
- Chipotle restaurants are designed to be clean/simple one-story buildings that function well, provide for nice landscaping amenities, sustainably constructed and pedestrian friendly. Their building methods are reputable and all associated materials are quality.
- Is using the City’s Master Tree list.
- The Project will feature patios using ‘natural’ materials and umbrellas for shade purposes.
- Likes the location of the proposed new restaurant in Ukiah.

Member Hawkes:
- Sees the building would likely comply with the 70% street frontage requirement if the building is turned.

Planning Director Stump:
- Would have to look whether turning the building complies with the 70% street frontage requirement where the intent of the standard is to get buildings up on the street front as much as possible. In this case, the building scenario differs because it is a corner lot and Orchard Avenue is almost as ‘prominent’ as Perkins Street. An exception to the street frontage requirement is likely to be supported since glass and patios would be on both sides of the street frontages.

Reed Finlay:
- Very important to note the restaurant would be located at a very key intersection so it makes sense architecturally to have the dining area face the corner.

Member Thayer:
- Noted the 10-foot public right-of-way area on Perkins Street may not be correct from the standpoint the Perkins Street streetscape project plans are not in place at this time and asked if the public right-of-way in this area will change?
- Related to access, if there is really no opportunity for a vehicle connection to the restaurant site, there needs to be a pedestrian connection from the westerly underutilized parking area to the restaurant.
- Asked about compliance with the City parking standard of one tree planted for every four parking spaces and why this was not the case for the underutilized parking lot area.
- As part of the landscaping plan would be nice to see the adjacent property and how it connects in this regard.

Vice Chair Liden:
- Requested clarification for the entrance being located on the corner?

Member Hawkes:
- Likes that the entrance is up close and not in the parking area.

Member Nicholson:
- Questioned access to the rest of the shopping center. If a person wants to drive to the restaurant, it would be difficult to get onto the freeway without some maneuvering and forethought. Is there a way to get access to the parking lot?
- Supports having well-defined pedestrian access from the shopping center.
- Related to having a streetscape plan in place at some point referred to his proposed landscaping modifications that are incorporated into the minutes as attachment 1.
• Related to the proposed landscape plan was not clear what are trees and what are shrubs. Supports having more substantial trees and is of the opinion this approach would provide for a more pedestrian friendly environment as well as soften the corner area while leaving it open enough for the advertising of the restaurant.

• Referred to sheet 2 of his proposed project modification plans related to the building as ‘a user’ where his preference would be to pull the awning outward so it covers the outdoor dining area, which would provide for a shelter but leave an opening between the building and the outdoor dining area with the hope it would not compromise the mass/size, scale and proportion of the building. Supports the property owner and architect consider this design amenity. Important to get the design concept because of the potential effect this building will have in the neighborhood and with it being located at an intersection on a primary gateway. Is of the opinion allowing for nice pedestrian entry from the shopping center area and having a dining area that is sheltered creates more of a ‘sense of place.’

Dan Thomas, Applicant:

• Acknowledged access to the parking lot is problematic. The major tenants in the shopping center have a reciprocal parking agreement that requires their permission to make changes and is unable to make this happen.

• Acknowledged the existing Redwood trees were planted years ago for purposes of a driveway.

• Requested clarification the City easement comes right up to the south end of the planter area?

Planning Director Stump:

• The concept of the Perkins Street streetscape project has been discussed as it relates to the proposed project. Did not want to require the applicant plant trees/landscaping in this area only to possibly have it removed when the right-of-way is widened and referred to the site plans.

• Confirmed the public right-of-way in this area will change with the Perkins Street streetscape project.

• While there may be many other associated reasons for a corner entrance, part of the intent with regard to the DZC is to recapture the feel and look of the way buildings used to be constructed on corner lots.

• The DZC requires the opening and/or way people access the building be ‘off the corner.’

• While the building is not completely on the corner the entrance into the dining patio area is coming from the corner and is required.

• Two project components that require consideration are site circulation and the fact that the Orchard Avenue property line is askew and is not a complete rectangle. Consideration must also be given to the 10-foot public right-of-way in front on Perkins Street and this is the reason no landscaping and/or trees are shown on the site plans in this area.

• One would think the retail establishments in the shopping center would want the business the restaurant could generate and willing to consider possible changes with regard to the parking lot.

• People desiring to dine at the restaurant will likely use the underutilized parking area near the Chipole parking lot if the restaurant parking lot is full. It may be rather than trying to access the parking lot and finding it full that restaurant patrons will begin to consistently/automatically use the underutilized parking lot area.

• Allowing for an effective pedestrian connection from the underutilized parking lot area is very important/critical.

• It may be related to the City parking standard requiring one tree for every four parking spaces the reason this is not the case in the underutilized parking lot area is because of the large Redwood trees that exist in the area.

• Showed location of a possible pedestrian walkway from the underutilized parking lot.
Assistant Planner Johnson:
- Referred to the revised site plans dated March 26, 2015 and the draft Perkins Gateway Streetscape Study rendering incorporated in the minutes as attachment 2 and talked about the City easement/public right-of-way area on Perkins Street in connection with the planter area that fronts the property.

Reed Finlay:
- Asked what type of shelter awning is being proposed?

Member Nicholson:
- The shelter could be a solid form over the dining area so people can sit in this outdoor area rain or shine.
- Restaurant should have an architectural connection that fits with the existing shopping center buildings.
- Likes the proportion and scale of the proposed restaurant building; building has a ‘clean design’ that expresses the company brand well having very strong imagery.
- Preference is the darker color palate as opposed to the lighter (white color) as demonstrated in the site plans.
- Referenced a Chipotle restaurant in Los Angeles that exhibits a nice example of pulling the dining area into the façade of the building and this is what prompted him to think about having a shade structure over the dining area that can be pulled into the landscape area for the proposed restaurant in Ukiah. Such a structure would provide for a ‘sheltering feel’ to the dining experience.
- Has observed many contemporary casual restaurants in urban areas where the interior back of the outdoor dining area is pulled from the façade to allow for a sheltering area/sidewalk experience without actually being on the sidewalk. Finds this approach to be a nice feature and is architecturally appealing. May not be sufficient room for the Ukiah Chipotle restaurant to do this and as such supports as an alternative pulling the building outward over the dining area.
- Some Chipotle restaurants have created an art space to display public art. If there is any way to do this for the Ukiah Chipotle having this amenity would be great for the community. Display could be interior or exterior.

Member Thayer:
- The Chipotle restaurant is essentially the ‘first’ building a person would see driving into town discounting gas stations. What a person would identify with is the signage and mass of the building. The lot has been vacant for a long time so the new development should be reflective of what is going on in town. An art display/mural opportunity would be a nice amenity. It does not have to be part of the building but rather of some other element type that reflects what is going on in the town/county.
- Wood application should reflect what architecturally fits/is adaptable with Mendocino County theme. Understands the wood connotation/concept but questions ebay wood used as siding on the building related to quality, durability and aesthetics.
- Encourages applicant to be creative with regard to application of the City Master Tree List and to consider other possibilities that is more in keeping with the Chipotle restaurant theme and location of the building. Projects are required to use the City Master Tree list for parking lots so as to ensure adequate shade coverage.
- Landscaping species not related to the parking lot should be emblematic of what is going on with the building architecture.
- The planting area that immediately fronts Perkins Street is currently just a ‘placeholder’ until City plans related to the public right-of-way area for the Perkins Street streetscape improvement project are developed. The placeholder area will essentially get reworked as part of the Perkins Street streetscape improvement project and street trees will be
selected and planted in the sidewalk planter area at this point. As such, not knowing what
form the public right-of-way area will take makes it difficult for applicant to formulate
landscaping plans.

- Consider planting another tree in the western elevation area.

DRB/applicant discussion about the use of ebay wood as siding on the building.

Planning Director Stump:

- Confirmed the public right-of-way is 10 feet from where the sidewalk is located and 10
feet into the site. Project applicant not required to plant any trees in this public right-of-
way planter area because this area is not part of the project.
- Related to the Perkins Street streetscape project the intent is to wait and let the
streetscape improvement project plant the trees that are selected.
- There will not be any widening of the roadway on Orchard Avenue.

Reed Finlay:

- Requested clarification the requirement of the Master Tree List will be everywhere except
for the south and east elevation areas.
- Chipole is all about plants and trees and proposed to plant trees in the frontage area, but
understands it is not possible to develop the frontage area with landscaping at this time.

Member Thayer:

- The intent of the Master Tree list is for adherence to parking lot trees and street
frontages; accordingly, it could be that the street frontage is essentially not part of the
project or that a major exception would be requested. If an applicant wanted to do
something different, it would have to be proposed and go through the process. The
proposed Chipole restaurant project will go through the process so with this being the
case would encourage the applicant to be creative in the selection of the landscaping
palate and what would work appropriately with the ‘Chipole brand.’
- Referred to the recent Burger King remodel/improvement project and is of the opinion the
landscaping palate is inappropriate without consideration of what might work on the site,
Ukiah’s climate and is consistent with the Burger King brand.
- Would be willing to provide landscaping suggestions. Again, would encourage the
applicant to be creative with regard to selection of the landscaping tree and plant species.
- There are landscaping species that would work with the architecture and also fit
with/contribute to the Perkins Street streetscape project, preferably drought tolerant,
native plants.
- Would recommend no use of turf.
- Supports application of the lighter color palate.

Member Morrow:

- Is of the opinion Chipole will get foot traffic coming from the west where the hospital is
located and new courthouse will be built, etc., so it may be useful to tie in some type of
footpath to the project so as to draw people to the restaurant as opposed to just walking
across the parking lot. Having a connectivity would help with the aesthetic view in the
western area.
- Related to the site plans, can vision the patio ‘totally roasting’ in the summer and
supports focusing on shading and heat management.
- Likes the concept of the ‘set-in’ patio area as a way to keep this area cooler. Has seen
this type of feature for restaurants in Arizona.
- Supports the idea of using landscaping alternatives in place of lawns, such as granite.
- Is of the opinion the driveway entrances to the restaurant will likely be problematic for
people getting on and off the freeway.
- Preference is the brown palate for the building.
Member Thayer:
- Demonstrated the location where a footpath would likely work that would draw people walking from the westerly direction.
- Would like to see ‘more reflective paving surfaces/permeable paving surfaces.’
- Important to have pedestrian access from the shopping center.

Member Hawkes:
- Asked if both driveways are two-way?
- Supports application of the darker color palate. Is of the opinion the darker color is more ‘subtle.’

Vice Chair Liden:
- Supports application of the darker color palate, partially because he likes the shape of the building. The building is also one of the first things a person sees when coming to Ukiah on Perkins Street and is of the opinion the dark color is much more attractive than the white palate.
- Likes the bulk, orientation and proportion of the building.
- A two-story building would not be a good fit for the corner lot where the Chipole restaurant is proposed.
- Finds the tree concept discussed above very important.

Reed Finlay:
- Understands the landscape plan will need to show the connectivity to the surrounding areas, particularly the parking lot to the west.

Dan Thomas:
- The Orchard Avenue driveway only allows for turning right in and the Perkins Street driveway is only turning right out. A person can still turn into the driveway from Perkins Street.
- Property is unique in the DZC.

There was DRB discussion about the driveways and ways people can maneuver to and from the freeway.

M/S Nicholson/Morrow recommends the following with regard to the preliminary design:
1. Provide for good pedestrian connection to west parking lot;
2. East/west sidewalk be separate from the driveways such that the main entry is on the corner and continue the west sidewalk to the public sidewalk;
3. Encourage creative solution to finding appropriate trees for shading purposes;
4. Use darker color palate on building;
5. Project architect explore pulling part of the building out which would be a nice amenity for users that would still allow for sufficient light into the building. Structure does not have to be a solid roof but rather ‘expressed’ on the edges as a solid roof/architectural form where the element could be shaded for solar orientation and still provide shelter for people using the outdoor dining area;
6. No turf, use aggregate of some kind or some other non-water using element;
7. Consider some permeable paving instead of concrete/asphalt;
8. Creative tree selection; Preference is to see more street trees planted in connection with Perkins Street streetscape improvement project possibly in the planter area in front of Pear Tree shopping center;
9. Ask applicant to consider installation of art display area that could be indoors or outdoors.

Motion carried by all AYE voice vote. (5-0)

7. MATTERS FROM THE BOARD:
8. MATTERS FROM STAFF:

9. SET NEXT MEETING
The next regular meeting will be Thursday, April 9, 2015.

10. ADJOURNMENT
The meeting adjourned at 4:14 p.m.

______________________________
Cathy Elawadly, Recording Secretary
### Exterior Finish Legend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STUCCO #1</td>
<td>Fine pebble finish, painted white</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUCCO #2</td>
<td>Fine pebble finish, painted PPG Knights Armor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aluminum Storefront</td>
<td>Aluminum storefront with charcoal finish</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Exterior Elevation - West**

1/8' = 1'-0"

---

**FHA Architects**

14344 "Y" Street
SUITE NO. 254
Omaha, NE 68137-3905
TEL: 402.895.0979
FAX: 402.895.9061
www.fharchitects.com

**CHIPOTLE**

UKIAH

03/26/2015